International Education Hubs - Actors, Rationales and Challenges -

Toyo University
Tokyo, Japan
December 3, 2015

Jane Knight
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
University of Toronto
4 Key Messages

6 country level international education hubs Malaysia, Hong Kong, Singapore, UAE, Qatar, Botswana

- Three types of hubs – Student, Talent and Knowledge/Innovation

- Difference between types of hubs in terms of rationales, policy sectors/actors and outcomes

- Education Hubs are more than a brand – they require strategic planning, investment and strong collaboration among local and foreign actors

J Knight 2015
Crossborder Education

- **1st Generation - Student Mobility**
  - full degree, semester abroad, exchange etc

- **2nd Generation - Program and Providers**
  - twinning and franchise programs, joint/double degree programs, virtual, branch campus

- **3rd Generation - Education Hubs**
  - students, programs, providers, research centres, knowledge industries

J Knight 2015
Levels of Education Hubs

- **Country**
  - UAE, Singapore, Malaysia

- **Zone**
  - Incheon, Dubai, Iskandar

- **City**
  - Boston, Adelaide, Bangalore
Education Hubs - Examples

- Qatar (1995)
- Singapore (1998)
- United Arab Emirates (2003)
- Malaysia (2007)
- Botswana (2008)
- Hong Kong (2008)

These are self-acclaimed education hubs

- Korea, Sri Lanka, Bhutan, Mauritius, Bahrain, etc – emerging hubs
Working definition of Education HUB

- A planned effort

- To develop a critical mass of
  - Local and international actors
    - Students, edu providers, companies, research centres, knowledge industries

- Strategically engaged in
  - Crossborder education, training, knowledge and innovation initiatives
What is driving the race for hubs?

Different Perspectives

Host country/sponsor

Foreign HEIs, research centres, companies

Students/Employees- local and foreign
What are host government/sponsor rationales?

1. Internationalize and **modernize domestic HE sector**
2. Recruit, prepare and retain **skilled work force**
3. Generate **income** from foreign students and HEIs
4. Support **service** and **knowledge industries**
5. Increase **competitiveness** – economic and geo-political status (soft power) in region

*J Knight 2015*
Proposed Types/Models of Education Hubs

- Student Hub
- Talent Hub
- Knowledge/Innovation Hub
Differences --- 3 types of Hubs

Focus and Strategies can be similar

BUT ........ differences in

- Rationales
- Policy sectors and types of regulations
- Key actors
- Outcomes

J Knight 2015
Student hub

Focus
- Recruitment and education of students
- Attraction of foreign HEIs/IBCs

Drivers/rationales
- Increased access for local and int students
- Internationalize and modernize HEIs
- Revenue generation

Key policy sectors and actors
- Education, trade, foreign affairs
Talent Hub

Focus
- Recruitment and *retention* of int/local students and workers
  - Attraction of foreign HEIs and companies

- **Drivers/Rationales**
  - Need for more skilled labour
  - Move to service and knowledge economy
  - Economic competitiveness

- **Key policy sectors and actors**
  - Immigration, labour, industry, education

J Knight 2015
Knowledge/Innovation Hub

Focus

- Production of knowledge and innovation
- Recruitment of HEIs, R&D companies

Drivers/Rationales

- Build a knowledge-based economy
- Attract foreign direct investment
- Increase economic competitiveness
- Soft power - political influence

Key Actors and Policy Sectors

- Sc and Tech, Economic Dev, Education,

J Knight 2015
## Major Policy Actors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Hub</th>
<th>Talent Hub</th>
<th>Knowledge/Innovation Hub</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Immigration</td>
<td>Science and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>Labour</td>
<td>Economic Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

J Knight 2015
Classification of the six country international education hubs

Student
Talent
Knowledge/Innovation
Education Hubs - Country level

- **Qatar** 1995
  - 10 IBCs, Sci and Tech Park, new research facilities/projects

- **Singapore** 1998
  - 18 IBCs, 1000+ int programs, major int research initiatives

- **United Arab Emirates** 2003
  - 37 IBCs, free trade zones, int research cities/ projects

- **Malaysia** 2007
  - 7 IBCs, 1200+ int programs, major int student destination

- **Botswana** 2008
  - 2 IBCs, plan to be source of HR for 5 industrial hubs

- **Hong Kong** 2008
  - 4 IBCs, 1000+ int programs, int student recruitment plan
## Country Status as Type of Hub

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Current</th>
<th>Aspiration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qatar</td>
<td>Talent</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAE</td>
<td>Talent</td>
<td>Talent/Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Student/Talent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>!?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Talent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

J Knight 2015
## Branch Campus - 2009 and 2011
### Host Countries - Global

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top 5</th>
<th>UAE</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qatar</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Planning and Implementation

- **Planning**
  - Reactive - Proactive - Strategic

- **Implementation**
  - Fragmented - Coordinated - Integrated

J Knight 2015
Planning and Implementation

Planning Approach

Reactive ___________ Proactive ___________ Strategic
Hong Kong    Botswana    Malaysia    UAE    Qatar    Singapore

Implementation Approach

Fragmented ___________ Coordinated ___________ - Integrated
UAE    Hong Kong    Botswana    Malaysia    Singapore    Qatar
Financing Education Hubs

**Private**- local and foreign investors
- Economic free zones and incentives to encourage private investment
  - UAE (Dubai and RAK), Malaysia (Iskandar), Qatar, Korea (Incheon)

**Public/Govt**- primarily local
- Invitation based generous funding
  - UAE (Abu Dhabi), Qatar, Singapore
- Infrastructure and facilities provided and some operating costs
Challenges

- Competition among countries within region

- Competing agendas of key actors in host country and need for co-ordinated plans, policies and regulations (immigration, labour, education, etc)

- Link to national vision and innovation/HRD/industry/education and trade strategies?
Issues and Challenges

- Brain Train - Brain Gain – Brain Drain (unintended consequences!!)

- Relevance of HE programs to local context, labour market and knowledge/skill priorities

- Recognition of foreign qualifications
Education Hub Actors

Students Workers

HE Providers
HEIs, Training Org

Research Centres

Knowledge Industries

J Knight 2015
4 Key Messages

6 country level international education hubs
Malaysia, Hong Kong, Singapore, UAE, Qatar, Botswana

- Three types of hubs – Student, Talent and Knowledge/ Innovation

- Talent hubs (recruitment/retention) involves different actors and outcomes than student hubs.

- Collaboration within country, competition between countries, unintended consequences
Thank you
jane.knight@utoronto.ca
Education Hub Indicators

- Are indicators feasible and useful?

- Preliminary set for each type of hub applied to 6 countries

- Used existing data- World Bank, UNESCO, Word Economic Forum

- Major challenges to identify robust, comparable, appropriate indicators!
Student Type Indicators

- No. of international students
- Per cent of world int student pop
- Rate of increase of int student over 5 years
- Int students as % of total HE pop
- No of int branch campuses
- No of int collaborative programs
Indicators for Talent Hub

Quality of educ/training system*

- Public spending on HE as % of GDP
- Emigration rate with tertiary ed
- Availability of local staff training*
- % unemployed with tert ed

*opinion data

J Knight 2015
Knowledge/Innovation Hub

- Quality of scientific institutes*
- Availability of scientists and engineers*
- University-company collaboration*
- No of patents granted
- Capacity for Innovation*

*opinion data
Indicators

- Are they feasible?
- Are they useful?
- What do they measure?
  - Potential, Readiness, Success, Sustainability
- What are the benefits and risks of indicators (including unintended consequences)?